

Integrating Artificial Intelligence into Flipped Classrooms for Personalized, Data-Informed Active Learning

Prof. Shaikh Imran Ramzan

Professor & Principal, Marathwada College of Education, Rauza Bagh, Chh. Sambhajinagar (Aurangabad), Maharashtra, India

Abstract—The flipped classroom model has emerged as a significant pedagogical innovation that relocates direct instruction to pre-class individual learning while allocating in-class time to collaborative, higher-order cognitive activities. Despite its documented benefits, the model continues to encounter notable challenges, including variability in student preparedness, limited opportunities for individualized learning pathways, and insufficient access to real-time learning analytics to inform evidence-based instructional decision-making.

This article proposes and elaborates a comprehensive conceptual model, the AI-Augmented Flipped Learning (AAFL) Framework designed to address key structural challenges of the traditional flipped classroom within diverse Indian educational settings through the systematic integration of Artificial Intelligence (AI) technologies across all stages of the teaching–learning process.

Based on a synthesis of recent empirical studies, established theories of learning, and emerging AI applications in education relevant to large and heterogeneous classrooms, the study develops a multi-phase framework that aligns specific AI-supported interventions with each stage of flipped learning: pre-class preparation, in-class collaborative engagement, and post-class reinforcement. Particular attention is given to issues of digital access, multilingual learners, and varied learner readiness commonly observed in Indian schools and higher education institutions.

The AAFL Framework identifies five key domains of pedagogical improvement, they are

- personalized learning support,
- Real-time feedback,
- enhanced learner engagement,
- Accessibility and Inclusion
- teacher empowerment

The AAFL Framework offers a practical and scalable roadmap for educators, teacher-training institutions, and universities seeking to implement AI-enabled flipped learning effectively across varied educational environments. Evidence indicates that AI-supported

flipped learning can improve student preparedness, increase classroom participation in large class settings, and provide teachers with actionable analytics for data-informed and inclusive instructional practices. AI integration has the potential not only to enhance flipped classroom practices but also to address systemic challenges such as large class sizes, diverse learner needs, and limited instructional time prevalent in the Indian context.

Index Terms—Flipped Classroom, Artificial Intelligence, Personalized Learning, Data-Driven Instruction, Active Learning, Adaptive Technology, Educational Technology

I. INTRODUCTION

Over the past decade, educational discourse has increasingly shifted from teacher-dominated, lecture-based instruction toward learner-centred pedagogies that emphasize critical thinking, problem-solving, collaboration, and reflective learning. This transition is evident across school and higher education sectors in India, particularly in the context of outcome-based education, competency-based curricula, and digital learning initiatives promoted by agencies such as National Education Policy 2020 and University Grants Commission. Within this pedagogical transformation, the flipped classroom has emerged as a promising instructional strategy in which students engage with core learning materials, through recorded lectures, readings, or digital modules prior to class, while classroom time is utilized for application-oriented activities, collaborative learning, and conceptual clarification.

The flipped classroom model is grounded in established theories of learning. Bloom’s Revised Taxonomy highlights that lower-order cognitive

processes, such as remembering and understanding, may be undertaken independently, whereas higher-order processes, including application, analysis, synthesis, and evaluation, are best facilitated through guided interaction. By reallocating instructional time, the flipped classroom operationalizes this principle, enabling classrooms to function as spaces for inquiry-based and higher-order learning.

However, practical implementation in Indian educational contexts has revealed persistent challenges. Student preparation outside the classroom is often uneven due to varied digital access, linguistic diversity, and differing levels of academic readiness. Instructional materials frequently adopt a uniform design that does not accommodate individual learner needs. Teachers have limited real-time information about students' conceptual difficulties prior to classroom engagement, and learners with restricted technological access or weaker self-regulation skills may experience further disadvantage, particularly in rural or resource-constrained settings.

Artificial Intelligence (AI) offers significant potential to address these challenges. AI-enabled systems can support adaptive pre-class learning, monitor learner engagement, provide immediate feedback, analyse performance patterns, and equip teachers with actionable, data-driven insights. In the Indian context, AI integration can also assist multilingual learners, support differentiated instruction in large classrooms, and strengthen inclusive teaching practices. Thus, the convergence of AI and flipped learning represents not merely an incremental improvement but a transformative approach capable of enabling personalized and evidence-based active learning at scale.

In response, this article proposes the AI-Augmented Flipped Learning (AAFL) Framework, a comprehensive model for integrating AI technologies across all stages of the flipped classroom cycle. Following a review of relevant literature, the paper outlines the framework's conceptual structure, examines empirical support for its components, and discusses implications for practice, equity, teacher preparation, and future research in Indian educational settings.

II. THEORETICAL FOUNDATIONS OF THE FLIPPED CLASSROOM

The flipped classroom model finds its intellectual roots in constructivist theories of learning. Piaget's (1954) constructivism holds that learners actively construct knowledge through experience and reflection, rather than passively receiving information. Vygotsky's (1978) socio-cultural theory adds that learning is most effective within the Zone of Proximal Development — the space between what a learner can do independently and what they can achieve with guidance. The flipped model directly targets this zone: students acquire foundational knowledge independently, then leverage peer collaboration and teacher guidance during class to extend and deepen that knowledge.

Bloom's Revised Taxonomy provides a further scaffold. The flipped model relocates lower-order cognitive activities (recall, comprehension) to the pre-class space, where they can be accomplished at an individual pace. Higher-order activities application, analysis, evaluation, and creation are then the primary focus of in-class time. This inversion maximizes the value of face-to-face interaction, directing it toward the cognitive work that most benefits from collaboration and expert guidance.

The empirical literature on flipped classrooms is substantial and growing. A meta-analysis by Cheng, Ritzhaupt, and Antonenko (2019) examined 55 empirical studies and found significant positive effects on student achievement (effect size $d = 0.47$) across K-12 and higher education settings. Studies in STEM disciplines have been particularly favourable, Deslauriers et al. (2011) found that interactive engagement in flipped physics courses produced learning gains nearly twice those of traditional lecture formats.

Beyond achievement, flipped classrooms have demonstrated benefits for student engagement, motivation, and metacognitive development. Abeysekera and Dawson (2015) theorized that flipping increases student autonomy and reduces extrinsic motivation pressures, fostering more genuine intellectual curiosity. Love et al. (2014) reported significant gains in student satisfaction and perceived learning in a flipped calculus course.

However, a parallel body of literature documents the model's challenges. Hew and Lo (2018) identified inconsistent student preparation as the primary implementation obstacle. Students who do not engage with pre-class materials cannot contribute meaningfully to in-class activities, creating equity gaps within the same classroom. Additional concerns include increased workload for teachers producing quality instructional video content, and the digital divide that limits access for disadvantaged students.

Artificial Intelligence in Education

AI in education (AIEd) encompasses a broad range of technologies: machine learning, natural language processing (NLP), computer vision, and knowledge representation systems. Intelligent tutoring systems (ITS), among the earliest AI applications in education, have demonstrated consistent positive effects on learning outcomes, comparable to one-to-one human tutoring in some studies (VanLehn, 2011). Modern AIEd technologies extend far beyond ITSs, encompassing adaptive learning platforms, AI writing assistants, automated assessment engines, learning analytics dashboards, and conversational agents (chatbots).

Luckin et al. (2016) articulated a vision of AI as a 'co-learner' a system capable of modelling student knowledge, identifying gaps, and scaffolding learning in real time. This vision aligns closely with the needs of the flipped classroom. If AI can monitor pre-class engagement, identify misconceptions before class, and personalize content delivery, it can solve the flipped model's most persistent structural problem: the uncertain quality of student preparation.

III. RESEARCH GAP: TOWARD AI-INTEGRATED FLIPPED LEARNING FRAMEWORKS

Although both flipped learning and Artificial Intelligence in Education (AIEd) have been widely examined in international and Indian scholarship, their systematic integration has received

comparatively limited theoretical and empirical attention. Existing models typically position AI applications as supportive or supplementary tools rather than as core structural elements of the flipped learning design. Consequently, there remains a lack of comprehensive frameworks that embed AI within the pedagogical architecture of flipped classrooms, particularly in contexts characterized by large and diverse learner populations, multilingual settings, and varying levels of digital access commonly observed in Indian education systems.

The present study seeks to address this gap by proposing the AI-Augmented Flipped Learning (AAFL) Framework, which conceptualizes AI as an integral component of the flipped learning cycle rather than a peripheral enhancement. The framework operationalizes AI integration across the three key phases of flipped learning, pre-class preparation, in-class engagement, and post-class reinforcement while aligning these interventions with five domains of pedagogical improvement. By doing so, the AAFL Framework offers a contextually relevant and scalable model for Indian schools, teacher-education institutions, and universities striving to implement technology-enabled, learner-centred pedagogy in line with reforms such as National Education Policy 2020.

IV. THE AI-AUGMENTED FLIPPED LEARNING (AAFL) FRAMEWORK

Framework Overview

The AAFL Framework is organized around three temporal phases of the flipped learning cycle Pre-Class, In-Class, and Post-Class and five cross-cutting advantage domains that AI is positioned to amplify - Personalization, Real-Time Feedback, Engagement, Accessibility, and Teacher Empowerment. The framework is built on a data loop, AI systems continuously collect, analyze, and act on data generated by student interactions across all three phases, creating a self-improving cycle of instruction and learning.

Table showing AAFL Framework Phases, AI Roles, and Tools

Sr. no.	Phase	Core AI Function	Representative Technologies	Primary Advantage Domain
I	Pre-Class	Adaptive content delivery; engagement monitoring	Adaptive LMS, AI video analytics, NLP-based quizzes	Personalization, Feedback
II	In-Class	Real-time formative assessment; group optimization	AI polling tools, Learning analytics dashboards, AI tutors	Engagement, Teacher Empowerment
III	Post-Class	Personalized practice; predictive intervention	Adaptive practice platforms, Predictive analytics, AI writing tools	Personalization, Accessibility

Phase I - Pre-Class Preparation

Within the flipped learning model, the pre-class phase constitutes a critical determinant of overall instructional effectiveness. Inadequate or inconsistent student preparation can significantly weaken the quality of in-class collaborative engagement. In the Indian educational context where classrooms often comprise diverse learners with varying academic readiness, linguistic backgrounds, and levels of digital access this vulnerability becomes even more pronounced. Artificial Intelligence (AI) offers a viable mechanism to mitigate this challenge through adaptive content delivery, defined as the dynamic customization of instructional materials based on individual learner characteristics, prior knowledge, and pace of learning.

Adaptive Content Delivery

Contemporary adaptive learning platforms such as Smart Sparrow, Knewton, and Coursera employ machine learning algorithms to generate individualized learner profiles. As students interact with digital pre-class materials, these systems continuously update their estimation of each learner’s knowledge state and accordingly modify the instructional pathway. Learners who demonstrate conceptual difficulty receive additional explanations, scaffolded examples, or remedial exercises, whereas those who exhibit mastery progress to advanced content. Such adaptive mechanisms transform pre-class preparation from a uniform and passive process into an interactive and personalized learning experience.

Engagement monitoring

AI-driven video analytics further strengthen this process. Tools such as Panopto and Edpuzzle provide granular engagement data, capturing not only completion rates but also behavioural indicators such as pauses, repeated views, and drop-off points. These analytics enable educators to identify specific concepts that require clarification prior to classroom instruction. In large Indian classrooms, where individualized monitoring is otherwise challenging, such data-driven insights can support targeted pedagogical interventions and more effective in-class facilitation.

Through adaptive content delivery and learning analytics, AI has the potential to strengthen the foundational pre-class phase of flipped learning, thereby enhancing preparedness, inclusivity, and instructional responsiveness.

Embedding brief formative assessments within pre-class learning materials serves a dual pedagogical function: it promotes active cognitive engagement with instructional content and generates diagnostic data on learner understanding. Recent advances in Artificial Intelligence enable automated generation of quiz items from instructional texts using natural language processing techniques, adaptive modification of question difficulty based on learner performance, and provision of immediate, explanatory feedback.

Evidence from cognitive science indicates that retrieval practice significantly enhances long-term retention and conceptual understanding. AI-enabled micro-assessments operationalize this principle at scale, reducing the burden on teachers to manually design and grade quizzes for each lesson. Such tools

are particularly valuable in Indian classrooms characterized by large enrolments, varied learner preparedness, and limited instructional time, as they support continuous formative assessment without increasing teacher workload.

Phase II: In-Class Engagement

AI-supported pre-class systems generate detailed data regarding student preparation, including completion patterns, conceptual misunderstandings, and areas of difficulty. Learning analytics dashboards integrated within platforms such as Canvas, Blackboard, or analytics platforms like Civitas Learning present these insights to teachers prior to and during classroom sessions.

Such analytics facilitate responsive teaching practices. Instead of beginning every class with a uniform content review, teachers can focus on concepts that require clarification, design targeted activities, and form peer-learning groups based on students' levels of understanding. This approach is especially relevant in Indian higher education institutions and schools where large class sizes often limit individualized feedback.

Real-Time Formative Assessment

AI-enabled audience response systems such as Poll Everywhere and Mentimeter allow teachers to conduct quick conceptual checks during classroom activities and analyse responses instantly. When a significant proportion of students demonstrate misunderstanding, teachers can modify instruction immediately, providing clarification or redesigning learning tasks.

Such real-time formative assessment is particularly valuable in Indian educational settings, where delayed evaluation cycles often restrict timely pedagogical intervention. Integration of AI-supported classroom feedback mechanisms aligns with contemporary educational reforms emphasizing competency-based learning and continuous assessment under initiatives such as National Education Policy 2020.

Group optimization

Artificial Intelligence can further enhance collaborative learning by enabling student grouping, by analysing pre-class performance data, AI systems can create heterogeneous groups that balance

conceptual strengths, learning preferences, and complementary knowledge gaps. Research in social constructivist learning emphasizes the importance of peer interaction in knowledge development; AI-assisted grouping ensures that collaborative learning arrangements are pedagogically meaningful rather than random.

Conversational AI tools, including chatbot-based academic assistants, can provide additional support during in-class activities. Students engaged in group work or problem-solving tasks can seek hints or conceptual clarification without interrupting peers or waiting for teacher assistance. This approach helps teachers focus on higher-order facilitation while ensuring that students especially those reluctant to ask questions in large classrooms receive timely academic support.

Phase III - Post-Class Reinforcement

The post-class phase plays a critical role in consolidating and sustaining learning outcomes. Artificial Intelligence-enabled platforms that incorporate spaced-repetition algorithms, such as Anki, Cerego, and Duolingo, schedule revision activities at optimal intervals tailored to individual learner performance.

By operationalizing principles derived from memory research in an automated and personalized manner, these systems help strengthen retention and conceptual clarity an approach particularly valuable in Indian classrooms with large enrolments, where individualized monitoring is difficult.

Personalized practice

Adaptive practice tools further extend personalized learning by identifying specific conceptual gaps and directing students toward targeted exercises. This process creates a continuous feedback loop: data from pre-class preparation to in-class engagement which generates performance insights that guide post-class reinforcement. Such an integrated approach aligns with competency-based learning goals promoted in contemporary Indian education reforms.

Predictive intervention

AI-driven predictive analytics can identify students at risk of academic difficulty by analysing patterns in attendance, engagement with digital resources, and

formative assessment performance. Early-alert systems embedded within analytics platforms such as Civitas Learning or enterprise learning management systems enable instructors and academic support teams to intervene proactively through counselling, remedial instruction, or peer mentoring.

Such proactive monitoring is especially important in Indian institutions serving first-generation learners or students from diverse socio-economic backgrounds, where early academic support can significantly improve retention and learning outcomes. Integration of predictive analytics with student-support mechanisms is consistent with inclusive education priorities emphasized under initiatives such as National Education Policy 2020.

Implementation Strategy for Indian Educational Institutions

The successful operationalization of the AI-Augmented Flipped Learning (AAFL) Framework in Indian schools and higher education institutions requires a phased, context-sensitive, and policy-aligned approach. Given the diversity of institutional capacities, infrastructural variations, and learner demographics across India, implementation must balance technological innovation with inclusivity and sustainability.

Institutional Readiness and Infrastructure Assessment
Prior to adoption, institutions should undertake a systematic readiness assessment encompassing digital infrastructure, faculty preparedness, learner access to devices, and availability of Learning Management Systems (LMS). While many universities and autonomous colleges have adopted digital platforms following the expansion of online education initiatives during and after the COVID-19 period, disparities remain between urban and rural institutions.

Alignment with national digital initiatives such as Digital India and platforms like SWAYAM and DIKSHA can facilitate cost-effective integration. Institutions may initially implement AI tools within existing LMS ecosystems rather than investing in entirely new technological infrastructures.

Faculty Capacity Building and Professional Development

The transition toward AI-integrated flipped learning necessitates structured faculty development programs. Teachers require training not only in technological tools but also in data interpretation, adaptive instructional design, and ethical considerations related to AI usage.

Workshops, certificate programs, and peer-learning communities can be established under the guidance of bodies such as the University Grants Commission and the All India Council for Technical Education. Teacher education institutions may incorporate AI-enabled pedagogy within pre-service and in-service training curricula to ensure long-term sustainability.

Ensuring Equity and Inclusive Access

In the Indian context, digital equity remains a central concern. Implementation strategies must account for students with limited internet connectivity, shared devices, or multilingual learning needs. Institutions may adopt blended access models, including offline downloadable content, low-bandwidth solutions, and mobile-compatible platforms.

AI systems should be evaluated for linguistic inclusivity, particularly in institutions serving learners from diverse regional language backgrounds. Equity safeguards should align with inclusive education principles articulated in National Education Policy 2020.

V. AI'S IMPACT ACROSS THE FIVE PEDAGOGICAL ADVANTAGE DOMAINS

Personalized Learning Support

This support represents one of the most significant pedagogical contributions of Artificial Intelligence to the flipped classroom model. Conventional flipped approaches typically provide uniform pre-class instructional materials to all learners, irrespective of differences in prior knowledge, learning pace, or cognitive readiness. In contrast, AI-enabled systems transform this standardized model into a dynamic and adaptive learning environment. Learners demonstrating conceptual mastery can progress to advanced content, whereas those encountering difficulty receive additional scaffolding, illustrative examples, and alternative explanations tailored to their needs.

Empirical research on adaptive learning environments indicates improved performance outcomes in both immediate and delayed assessments when compared with non-adaptive systems. When such AI-driven personalization is embedded within the pre-class phase of flipped learning, students enter classroom sessions with differentiated levels of preparedness aligned to their individual learning trajectories rather than the class mean. This approach is particularly relevant in Indian educational settings, where heterogeneity in academic backgrounds and linguistic diversity necessitate differentiated instructional strategies.

Real-time Feedback

Real-time Feedback has consistently been identified as a high-impact instructional variable in educational research. However, in many traditional and even technology-supported classrooms, feedback is delayed, often arriving after the optimal learning window has passed. AI integration substantially reduces this lag by enabling immediate, data-driven responses across all phases of the flipped learning cycle.

During pre-class preparation, AI-embedded assessments provide instant explanatory feedback. In the classroom, analytics dashboards offer real-time insights into collective and individual learning patterns, allowing teachers to modify instruction dynamically. Post-class AI-supported evaluation tools further extend timely feedback to written assignments and reflective tasks. By compressing the feedback cycle, AI enhances the responsiveness and effectiveness of instruction an especially valuable capability in large Indian classrooms where individualized teacher feedback is often constrained by workload.

Enhanced Learner Engagement

Sustaining student engagement remains a challenge in both traditional and flipped instructional models. The self-directed nature of pre-class learning requires a degree of intrinsic motivation that may vary significantly among learners. AI-enabled engagement mechanisms such as gamified adaptive modules, interactive quizzes, progress-tracking dashboards, and conversational support systems provide structured scaffolding that encourages consistent participation.

From a motivational perspective, learner engagement is strengthened when students experience autonomy, competence, and meaningful social interaction. AI personalization supports competence by aligning tasks with current ability levels; adaptive pacing promotes autonomy by allowing learners to progress at an individualized rate; and AI-supported collaborative tools foster peer interaction. Within the Indian context, where classrooms often comprise students from diverse socio-cultural and academic backgrounds, such structured engagement mechanisms can help bridge motivational disparities and promote sustained participation.

Accessibility and Inclusion

The flipped classroom model has at times been critiqued for presupposing access to reliable digital infrastructure and strong self-regulation skills conditions not uniformly available across Indian educational contexts. Although AI cannot fully eliminate systemic inequities, it can mitigate several barriers to access.

AI-enabled accessibility features including automated captioning, speech-to-text and text-to-speech functionalities, multilingual translation, and compatibility with assistive technologies—enhance inclusivity for learners with disabilities and for those studying in a second language. Chatbot-based academic support provides on-demand assistance beyond conventional classroom hours, benefiting students who may lack access to private tutoring. Mobile-optimized AI platforms further expand reach in regions where smartphone access exceeds desktop availability. These features align with inclusive education priorities emphasized under National Education Policy 2020, which advocates equitable and technology-enabled learning opportunities.

Teacher Empowerment

Concerns are often expressed that AI integration may diminish the central role of teachers. However, within the AAFL Framework, AI functions as an augmentative rather than a substitutive tool. By automating routine instructional tasks such as basic content delivery, preliminary assessments, and standard query resolution AI enables teachers to concentrate on higher-order pedagogical responsibilities, including mentorship, facilitation of

complex inquiry, socio-emotional support, and creative instructional design.

AI-driven learning analytics dashboards provide educators with detailed insights into student engagement patterns, conceptual progress, and areas requiring intervention. Such evidence-based visibility supports informed instructional decision-making at both individual and cohort levels. In large Indian classrooms, where manual monitoring of every learner is impractical, AI-enhanced analytics strengthen professional agency by enabling data-informed and context-responsive teaching practices.

VI. CONCLUSION

The integration of Artificial Intelligence within flipped learning environments represents a transformative opportunity for Indian education. When strategically aligned with national policy objectives and institutional capacities, the AAFL Framework has the potential to strengthen personalized learning, enhance instructional responsiveness, and empower teachers with actionable insights.

Rather than replacing educators, AI augments professional expertise, enabling a shift from content transmission toward mentorship, facilitation, and higher-order learning engagement. In doing so, AI-integrated flipped pedagogy offers a viable pathway toward scalable, inclusive, and future-ready education in India.

REFERENCES

- [1] Abeysekera, L., & Dawson, P. (2015). Motivation and cognitive load in the flipped classroom: Definition, rationale and a call for research. *Higher Education Research & Development*, 34(1).
- [2] Anderson, L. W., & Krathwohl, D. R. (Eds.). (2001). *A taxonomy for learning, teaching, and assessing: A revision of Bloom's taxonomy of educational objectives*. Longman.
- [3] Bergmann, J., & Sams, A. (2012). *Flip your classroom: Reach every student in every class every day*. International Society for Technology in Education.
- [4] Bharti, P., & Sharma, M. (2021). Flipped classroom in Indian higher education: A case study. *Journal of Educational Technology*.
- [5] Bransford, J. D., Brown, A. L., & Cocking, R. R. (2000). *How people learn: Brain, mind, experience, and school*. National Academy Press.
- [6] Cheng, L., Ritzhaupt, A. D., & Antonenko, P. (2019). Effects of the flipped classroom instructional strategy on students' learning outcomes: A meta-analysis. *Educational Technology Research and Development*, 67(4), 793–824.
- [7] Ebbinghaus, H. (1885/1913). *Memory: A contribution to experimental psychology*. Teachers College, Columbia University.
- [8] Hattie, J., & Timperley, H. (2007). The power of feedback. *Review of Educational Research*, 77(1), 81–112.
- [9] Hew, K. F., & Lo, C. K. (2018). Flipped classroom improves student learning in health professions education: A meta-analysis. *BMC Medical Education*, 18(1), 38.
- [10] Gupta, D., & Garg, P. (2022). AI in Indian higher education: Opportunities and challenges. *University News*.
- [11] Love, B., Hodge, A., Grandgenett, N., & Swift, A. W. (2014). Student learning and perceptions in a flipped linear algebra course. *International Journal of Mathematical Education in Science and Technology*, 45(3), 317–324.
- [12] Luckin, R., Holmes, W., Griffiths, M., & Forcier, L. B. (2016). *Intelligence unleashed: An argument for AI in education*. Pearson.
- [13] National Education Policy 2020, Ministry of Education India (2020), Government of India
- [14] Piaget, J. (1954). *The construction of reality in the child*. Basic Books.
- [15] Roediger, H. L., & Butler, A. C. (2011). The critical role of retrieval practice in long-term retention. *Trends in Cognitive Sciences*, 15(1), 20–27.
- [16] Shute, V. J. (2008). Focus on formative feedback. *Review of Educational Research*, 78(1), 153–189.
- [17] Vandewaetere, M., Desmet, P., & Clarebout, G. (2012). The contribution of learner characteristics in the development of computer-based adaptive learning environments. *Computers in Human Behavior*, 27(1), 118–130.

- [18] VanLehn, K. (2011). The relative effectiveness of human tutoring, intelligent tutoring systems, and other tutoring systems. *Educational Psychologist*, 46(4), 197–221.
- [19] Vygotsky, L. S. (1978). *Mind in society: The development of higher psychological processes*. Harvard University Press.